

**Carlyle/Eisenhower East Design Review Board  
May 9, 2007**

**REQUEST:** Design Concept approval of an office building with ground-floor retail and above grade parking

**LOCATION:** Carlyle Plaza, 1800 Eisenhower Avenue (Block P)

**APPLICANT:** JM Zell Partnership, by Elizabeth Wilcox

---

**BOARD ACTION:** On a motion by Mr. Lewis, seconded by Mr. Quill, the Carlyle Design Review Board voted to approve the request for the concept design of the building, subject to compliance with all applicable codes and ordinances. The following conditions were included:

1. The Applicant shall study further refinements of the building top concept that was presented at the CDRB hearing for review at a subsequent hearing.
2. The Applicant shall study alternate approaches to screening of the parking garage openings on Eisenhower Ave, John Carlyle St, and South Carlyle Park, to comply with the approved Block P Design Guidelines requirement that the parking structure “shall be treated with high quality materials to appear as an extension of the building(s) and that openings – fenestration shall be comparable to the building.” The discussion focused on the use of a combination of glass, metal louvers, perforated metal, art glass, and other materials. These studies shall be reviewed at a subsequent Board hearing.
3. The Applicant shall prepare an exhibit presenting approaches to address the SUP requirement for a minimum retail depth of 40’-0” along John Carlyle St subject to review at a subsequent hearing.
4. The Applicant shall study further refinements of the green garage screen concept that was presented at the CDRB hearing for review at a subsequent hearing.
5. In order to comply with Condition #70A of the Carlyle SUP, applicant shall increase the retail level such that the minimum clear height (slab-slab) shall be 18’-0”, while limiting the height of the top of parking (1st office floor) to not more than 64’-0”. In view of providing a ground level that is equivalent in height to two floors, the SUP requirement for parking setbacks along Eisenhower Ave and John Carlyle St will be deemed not to apply.
6. The Applicant shall shift the building 3’-0” to the west, to provide a minimum 20 foot wide sidewalk along John Carlyle St, adjacent to on-street parallel parking, and provide street trees on Hooff’s Run Dr as depicted at the CDRB hearing.
7. The Applicant shall demonstrate that the retail space incorporates venting systems required for food preparation, exhaust vent shafts and grease traps, service corridors/areas, in compliance with SUP Condition #70A.
8. The Applicant shall demonstrate compliance with the balance of the Carlyle SUP and Block P Design Guidelines.

The motion carried on a vote of 3-0.

**I. REQUEST**

JM Zell Partnership has requested DRB approval of the proposed concept design for Carlyle Plaza, Phase I of a new mixed-use office building at 1800 Eisenhower Avenue. This case has previously been heard and deferred by the DRB twice, at the March 14, 2007 and November 30, 2006 meetings.

## **II. PROJECT FACTS AND FIGURES**

### *Project Location:*

The proposed mixed-use office building will be located on a 2.18-acre currently vacant site. Eisenhower Avenue and a proposed five-story residential building on Block O are to the north; John Carlyle Street and Phase II of the subject project to the east; South Carlyle Square and a five-story residential building to the south; and Hooff's Run Drive and an anticipated 200-foot tall, 180,000 sf residential building to the west.

### *Project Details:*

The proposed building consists of two connected office towers on top of 5 levels of above-grade parking and a single story of retail space. The south tower is approximately 182 ft tall. The north tower is lower, at approximately 147 ft high. The building reads as two pre-cast clad office blocks with a continuous dark stone base along John Carlyle Street. Visible from the I-495 Beltway, the tallest portion is the south end of the building, which is designed as a vertically oriented glass accent.

Although the building is predominantly masonry, glass accents are proposed along Eisenhower Avenue and at the south end of the building. Additional stone is used as an accent material, primarily in the spandrels. Metal accents are also used minimally throughout the building.

## **III. STAFF ANALYSIS**

At the March 14, 2007 meeting, the Board directed the applicant to proceed with the design of the building in compliance with a number of conditions from both the Board and staff. The applicant has continued to work on the design and has addressed some of the major points. Unfortunately, in changing the design to comply with certain of the SUP conditions, applicant has created new conflicts with that document and the Block P Design Guidelines, which now must be resolved. In addition, some of the design issues raised at the previous meeting have not yet been successfully addressed. The major design and compliance issues are as follows:

- 1.) The reduction of the first floor height to 16 ft will not allow the required minimum clear ceiling height of 15 ft in the retail space, and will also require setback of parking from the north and east faces of the building on the P2 Level a distance of 30 ft (Eisenhower Ave.) and 22 ft (John Carlyle St.), per SUP Condition 70A. Alternatively, the ground-level may be modified to be a minimum of 20 ft high as previously represented to the Board.
- 2.) The proposal continues not to meet the minimum depth of retail required (60 ft along Eisenhower Ave., and 40 ft along John Carlyle St., per SUP Condition 70A.

- 3.) As previously recommended, shift the building approximately 5 ft to the west to provide an appropriate sidewalk width on John Carlyle St. and reduce the width on Hooff's Run Dr. (which is designated as a "C" street in the Eisenhower East Small Area Plan Design Guidelines.)
- 4.) The current solution involving large-scale metal louvers does not satisfy the Block P Design Guidelines of the SUP, both of which require that garage façades on the north, east, and south shall be "treated with high quality materials to appear as an extension of the building(s); openings/fenestration shall be comparable to the building."
- 5.) The Garage façade treatment proposed along Hooff's Run Dr. (a vegetated screen system) appears to comply with the Block P Design Guidelines, but the Board will need more detailed information to make this determination.
- 6.) The challenge of creating a prominent skyline has been discussed extensively since the initial review submission for this proposal. The design as it stands does not create a strong and memorable skyline image when seen from the beltway or other distant vantage points (see applicant's photomontage.) Although the applicant has revised the south tower element to create a more dramatic presence, the design area still lacks adequate tension and vertical emphasis.

While the building heights and footprints are consistent with the design guidelines for this portion of Block P, the floor area is more than was anticipated by the guidelines, since virtually all of the approved office floor area is being used in Phase I. The transfer of floor area from the east block (Phase II) to the west block, and subsequent transfer of floor area to allow construction of Phase II will require approval by the Planning Commission and City Council.

Table 1 details consistencies and conflicts with the applicable guidelines and conditions. Staff notes that there are still outstanding regulatory compliance issues.

Table 1. Compliance with Block P Design Guidelines and Carlyle SUP Conditions<sup>1</sup>

	<b>Block P Design Guidelines/ SUP Conditions</b>	<b>Development Proposal</b>	<b>Consistent</b>
<b>DESIGN GUIDELINES</b>			
<b>Land Use</b>	342,191 sf Office 53,991 sf Retail	336,991 sf Office 24,578 sf Retail	<b>No<sup>2</sup></b>
<b>Location of Easements</b>	66 ft ROW on John Carlyle St	66 ft ROW on John Carlyle St	Yes
<b>Sidewalk</b>	<u>Eisenhower Ave:</u> W of John Carlyle St: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 22-25 ft from property line</li> </ul> <u>Hooff's Run Dr:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 14-ft wide sidewalk, consisting of 10 ft wide unobstructed sidewalk w/4 ft wide tree wells</li> </ul> <u>John Carlyle St:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 14 ft from curb line</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 33 ft from property line</li> <li>▪ 23.9 ft sidewalks; no tree wells shown</li> <li>▪ 17 ft from curb</li> </ul>	Yes  <b>Yes, but need to show streetscape improvements</b> Yes
<b>Ground floor summary</b>			
Office	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Primary entries on John Carlyle St</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Office lobby on John Carlyle St</li> </ul>	Yes
Retail	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Storefront retail entries on Eisenhower, portions of John Carlyle St, open space frontage</li> <li>▪ Min 60 ft depth on Eisenhower Ave</li> <li>▪ Min 40 ft depth on John Carlyle St</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Retail entrances on all the required frontages</li> <li>▪ 60 ft depth along Eisenhower exclusive of stair</li> <li>▪ 40 ft depth not provided adjacent to office lobby</li> </ul>	Yes  Yes  <b>No</b>
<b>Parking and/or Service Access Zones</b>	<u>West property line:</u> 2 zones from Hooff's Run Dr at the N and S ends of the street shall be a max of 60' wide and 60' from the perpendicular property line	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 3 curb cuts provided</li> <li>▪ North curb cut approximately 98 ft from perpendicular property line</li> <li>▪ South curb cut approximately 110 ft from perpendicular property line</li> </ul>	<b>No<sup>3</sup></b>
<b>On-street parking</b>	Parallel parking on both sides of John Carlyle St & Hooffs Run Dr	Parallel parking provided on both sides of John Carlyle St; no parking provided on Hooff's Run Dr (need to show parking on west side)	<b>No<sup>4</sup></b>

	<b>Block P Design Guidelines/ SUP Conditions</b>	<b>Development Proposal</b>	<b>Consistent</b>
<b>Parking above grade</b>	<u>West of John Carlyle St:</u>  <i>Below 20 Ft. Street Wall Line:</i> Located within area bounded within 90 ft from the Eisenhower Ave property line, 70 ft from centerline of JCS, 60 ft from the S property line and 16 ft from Hooff's Run Dr property line.  <i>Above 20 Ft. Street Wall Line:</i> Located within area bounded within	No parking proposed below 20 ft	Yes
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 33 ft from Eisenhower Ave property line</li> <li>▪ 33 ft from centerline of John Carlyle St</li> <li>▪ 30 ft from the south property line, and</li> <li>▪ 16 ft from Hooff's Run Dr property line.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 33 ft</li> <li>▪ Approximately 38 ft from centerline of John Carlyle St.</li> <li>▪ 30 ft</li> <li>▪ Some areas are 14 ft from property line</li> </ul>	Yes
			Yes
			Yes
<b>Bulk</b>  Streetwalls	<u>John Carlyle St:</u> 20 ft <u>Eisenhower Ave:</u> 60 ft (West of John Carlyle St)	approx. 35 ft approx. 20 ft	<b>No<sup>3</sup></b> <b>No<sup>3</sup></b>
<b>Heights</b>	<u>West of John Carlyle St:</u> 175 ft at north end (Eisenhower Ave) & 200 ft max at the south end	North tower: 146.5 ft (top of roof) South tower : 182 ft (top of roof)	Yes
<b>Ground floor setbacks</b>	<u>Eisenhower Ave (West of John Carlyle St):</u> 22 to 25 ft from property line	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 33 ft from property line</li> </ul>	Yes
	<u>John Carlyle St:</u> 14 ft from curb	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 17 ft from curb</li> </ul>	Yes
<b>Upper floor setbacks</b>	<u>West of John Carlyle St:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 3-7 ft max setbacks at a building height of 50-60 ft</li> <li>▪ Additional 5-7 ft min setback at bldg height of 150-175 ft along Eisenhower Ave</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 4 ft setback at approx. 35 ft above AFG</li> <li>▪ Building is 146.5 ft (to top of roof)</li> </ul>	<b>No<sup>3</sup></b>
			Yes

	<b>Block P Design Guidelines/ SUP Conditions</b>	<b>Development Proposal</b>	<b>Consistent</b>
<b>Architectural expression &amp; lines</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Expression line at the top of the required street walls</li> <li>▪ Exposed portions of above grade parking structure on Hooffs Run shall be consistent with EESAP Design Guidelines for “C” streets</li> <li>▪ Parking structure shall be treated with high quality materials to appear as an extension of the building(s); openings/fenestration shall be comparable to the building</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ No expression line provided</li> <li>▪ Landscape screening provided</li> <li>▪ Metal louvers</li> </ul>	<p><b>No<sup>3</sup></b></p> <p><b>No<sup>4</sup></b></p> <p><b>No</b></p>
<b>Minimum distance between buildings</b>	Multiple towers above 80 ft tall must be placed 45 ft apart	Two towers, with three-story occupied link, approx 34 ft apart	<b>No<sup>3</sup></b>
<b>SUP CONDITIONS (DESIGN-RELATED)</b>			
<b>Condition #42</b>	All parking garages shall have clearances on the 1st parking level to accommodate full-size vans	Height of 1 <sup>st</sup> parking level: 8.5 ft (floor to floor)	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Condition #70A</b>	<p>b. - Applicant is responsible for “temporary” EVE along southern portion of the east &amp; west blocks</p> <p>e.i - Min. interior retail height shall 15 ft clear;</p> <p>e.ii - Min retail depth: 40 ft on John Carlyle St, 60 ft on Eisenhower Ave</p> <p>e.iii - A portion of the retail space shall incorporate venting systems required for food preparation, exhaust vent shafts &amp; grease traps, service corridors/areas</p> <p>f. - Above grade garage shall be setback a min of 30 ft on Eisenhower Ave &amp; 22 ft on John Carlyle St from the exterior walls of the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of the street frontage</p> <p>g. - Above grade garage on Hooff’s Run Dr shall be treated architecturally to be in harmony with the overall building design</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ EVE provided south of west block</li> <li>▪ Height appears to be 13 ft clear</li> <li>▪ 40 ft depth not provided adjacent to office lobby; 60 ft depth on Eisenhower excl. stairs</li> <li>▪ Not shown</li> <li>▪ Drawings unclear for Eisenhower Ave; 3.2 ft on John Carlyle St</li> <li>▪ Landscape screening provided</li> </ul>	<p><b>Yes for west block</b></p> <p><b>No</b></p> <p><b>No</b></p> <p><b>No</b></p> <p><b>No</b></p> <p><b>No<sup>4</sup></b></p>

	<b>Block P Design Guidelines/ SUP Conditions</b>	<b>Development Proposal</b>	<b>Consistent</b>
<b>Condition #73A</b>	Buildings shall be predominantly masonry and predominantly with punched windows	57.8% masonry provided; punched windows on all sides	Yes
<b>Condition #77</b>	Max. uninterrupted streetwall length w/o recesses or ground-floor setbacks shall be 150 ft	Adequate recesses provided on John Carlyle St & Hooffs Run Dr	Yes
<b>Condition #97</b>	a. - One penthouse per building b. - Penthouse 22 ft tall (DRB approved)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ One penthouse provided</li> <li>▪ 22 ft high penthouse, including tower</li> </ul>	Yes Yes
<b>Condition #101</b>	Above-grade parking shall be set back min 30 ft (Eisenhower Ave) & 22 ft (John Carlyle St) from the exterior building walls of the 1st & 2nd floor	Floor-to-floor retail height was reduced from 20 ft (2 stories) to approx 16 ft (1 story); parking has not been set back at 2nd floor	<b>No</b>

<sup>1</sup>Table 1 primarily reflects compliance items related to the west block of Block P.

<sup>2</sup>Only 5,200 sf of office space would remain for the east block of Block P, which is approximately 2.38 acres in size. Additional transfers of floor area will require subsequent SUP or applicable approval.

<sup>3</sup>Proposal approved by the DRB at the March 14, 2007 hearing.

<sup>4</sup>Requires additional staff and DRB review.

#### **IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends conceptual approval of the proposed plans dated April 11, 2007, subject to subsequent approval of the board and compliance with the following conditions:

##### General Building Comments:

1. The roofline shall be articulated to create a distinctive tower and skyline form when seen from the beltway or other distant vantage points.
2. The building façade shall be given additional variety to provide relief to the unbroken grid; this could be accomplished through the addition of breaks in the grid or other means.
3. Applicant shall explore ways to introduce more color/texture within the building.
4. The building shall be shifted approximately 5 ft to the west to provide a 22 ft. wide unobstructed sidewalk on John Carlyle St. from the curb to the face of the building.

##### Above-grade Parking Garage Comments:

5. The treatment of the above grade parking shall be revised to include glass panels for John Carlyle St., Eisenhower Ave., the southern façade and a portion of the façade on Hooff's Run Dr.
6. A detailed plan shall be provided of the planters, types of plant materials and metal screens proposed for the western portion of the building adjacent to Hooff's Run Drive.

7. All ramps for the parking garage shall be accommodated internally.
8. The minimum turning radius within the garage ramp shall be increased to the satisfaction of the Directors of P&Z and T&ES

Retail Comments:

9. Per the *Block P Design Guidelines*, the depth of the retail shall be a minimum of 60 ft on Eisenhower Avenue and 40 ft on John Carlyle St., except as limited by the northernmost stair tower.
10. The retail height shall be revised to be a minimum of 15 ft clear interior heights pursuant to the SUP Condition #70A.
11. The floor-to-floor retail height shall be revised to be a minimum of 20 ft., or parking along Eisenhower Avenue and John Carlyle Street shall be set back from the building face 30 feet and 22 feet, respectively, pursuant to SUP Condition #70A. To address this condition, the applicant shall revise the parking to continue to comply with the maximum height of 60 feet.
12. The retail space shall incorporate venting systems required for food preparation, exhaust vent shafts and grease traps, service corridors/areas, pursuant to SUP Condition #70A.

General:

13. The applicant shall responsible for submitting the following within 30 calendar days of the Design Concept approval by the Board.
  - a. A physical model depicting the building in context on the adjoining blocks shall be provided.
  - b. A ground-level perspective view from the southwest corner of the site shall be provided.
  - c. A photomontage image(s) of the revised profile shall be submitted showing views from the Capital Beltway.
  - d. A unified lighting strategy for the project shall be provided.
  - e. Additional information shall be provided to ensure compliance with SUP Condition #70A.
  - f. Additional information shall be provided to ensure compliance with SUP Condition #114 and TMP Conditions A7-A9.
  - g. Drawings and narrative to demonstrate full compliance with all conditions herein.
14. The final design, materials, colors and all design elements shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Board.

The following conditions have been addressed and are carried over from the previous Board hearing:

1. The successful treatment of the north tower, where the solid wall is carried up past the roof to create open frames, should be explored for the top of the south tower.

2. The corner accent towers should be restudied to be stronger, more prominent and more vertical.
3. The stone base should be refined to be more tectonic in expression, more refined in detail and surface, and more clearly articulated from the building wall, as with a reveal. Even though the retail base successfully reads as a veil, its tone is too similar to the rest of the building and needs to be differentiated.
4. The west façade should be redesigned to provide a stronger break between buildings and to make the towers appear more vertical.
5. Property lines shall be provided on future plans to ensure compliance with the *Block P Design Guidelines* for sidewalks and ground floor setbacks.