

Docket Item #26-A
MASTER PLAN AMENDMENT #99-0005
REZONING #99-0005
1460 DUKE STREET

Planning Commission Meeting
October 5, 1999

ISSUE: Consideration of a request for amendment to the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan Chapter of the 1992 Master Plan to change the land use designation and for an amendment to the zoning of the subject property from OCM-100/Office Commercial Medium and CDD-1/Coordinated Development District #1 to OCH/Office Commercial High, with the following proffer: "The use shall be limited to hotel."

APPLICANT: Duke-Jamieson, LLC
by Cyril D. Calley, attorney

LOCATION: 1460 Duke Street

CITY COUNCIL ACTION, OCTOBER 16, 1999: City Council approved the recommendation of the Planning Commission and approved the request, subject to compliance with all applicable codes and ordinances.

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION, OCTOBER 5, 1999: On a motion by Mr. Komoroske, seconded by Mr. Robinson, the Planning Commission voted to recommend approval of the request, subject to all applicable codes and ordinances and the staff recommendations. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0. Mr. Dunn was absent.

Reason: The Planning Commission felt that the proposed master plan amendment and rezoning were appropriate in this instance because they facilitated hotel development. It believed the proposed hotel was a desirable use at this location, and that the impacts of the hotel would be less than those created by an office use constructed with the current zoning. It also indicated that the hotel was well designed and brought benefits to the City through the improvements to the adjoining Hooff's Run.

Speakers:

Alan Young, 1301 Duke Street, spoke against.

Jane Starkey, 2121 Jamieson Avenue, spoke against.

Jack Young spoke in support.

Des Calley, representing the property owners.

Duncan Blair, representing Marriott.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends **denial**.

BACKGROUND:

The applicant, Duke-Jamieson L.L.C, by Cyril Calley, seeks approval of a master plan amendment and rezoning in order to change the land use designation and zoning of the properties located at 1456-1460 Duke Street from OCM-100/Office Commercial Medium and CDD-1/Coordinated Development District #1 to OCH/Office Commercial High, with a proffer limiting development on the site to “only a hotel.” The development plan for the hotel (DSUP#99-0042) is being processed concurrent with the application, as are two applications for vacation (VAC#99-004 and VAC#99-005) for portions of the future Jamieson Street right-of-way, at the rear of the site, and a portion of Hooff’s Run, along the western edge of the site.

The area proposed to be changed to OCH/Office Commercial High includes three separate pieces of land:

<u>Location/Description</u>	<u>Lot Size</u>	<u>Current Master Plan/ Zoning Designation</u>
1456 Duke Street (73.02-08-09)	50,798 sq.ft.	OCM-100
A portion of the Jamieson Avenue right-of-way to be vacated. (Parcel B, (a portion of 73.02-08-08)	2,276 sq.ft.	OCM-100
A portion of Hooff’s Run to be vacated (Lot 716, (a portion of 73.04-02-03)	<u>4,512 sq.ft.</u>	CDD#1*
Total	57,586 sq.ft.	

The large parcel is known as the “Santullo’s site” and was most recently occupied by the Upscale Resale business. The existing building is proposed to be demolished to allow for the construction of a 240 room hotel in a 163,000 net sq.ft. 77’ tall building over partially underground structured parking. The hotel and the staff analysis related to the hotel are discussed in significant detail in the report on the DSUP for the hotel.

Master Plan and Zoning History

The subject property is located within the King Street-Eisenhower Avenue Plan area. One of the small area plans key land use goals is *“to create a lively mixed use office, retail, residential and hotel development supported by open space, recreational, entertainment and cultural amenities.”* To achieve this goal, the plan has as its first objective *“to foster high quality, high density mixed use development around the two metrorail stations.”* To facilitate this goal, the City's highest density zones: OCH/Office Commercial High and CDD/Coordinated Development District, are concentrated in the two areas around the metrorail stations. But the subject property, located on the southeast edge of the plan area, was planned and zoned for a more moderate density of development: OCM-100/Office Commercial Medium. This OCM designation was intended, according to the small area plan, to create a transition between the higher density office/commercial development to the west and north and the lower density commercial and residential development to the east and south.

The subject property is one of 32 lots zoned OCM-100 or OCM-50 which are located on the south side of Duke Street starting west of Holland Lane. These OCM-zoned properties are adjacent to high density (OCH-3.0 FAR) property to the north and northwest, and medium-high density zoned property to the northeast (CD-2.5 FAR) and to the west (CDD-2.62 FAR). East and south of the OCM zoned area are much lower density zones: RB (0.75 FAR), OC (1.0 FAR) and CRMU-L (1.5 FAR proffered to 1.16). The CRMU-L was rezoned from RA and OC since the adoption of the 1992 small area plan, and has been developed in residential uses as Old Town Village townhouses and condominiums.

STAFF ANALYSIS:

Staff cannot support the proposed rezoning from OCM/100 and CDD#1 to OCH. The applicant offers as a rationale for the zoning the following statements:

The proposed development of a hotel will be a better use of the property and more compatible with the surrounding developments. The impact of traffic on Duke Street will be less than other uses. The proposed amendment to the zoning map will permit sufficient density for the proposed hotel.

Staff does not find the applicant's argument compelling. While staff agrees that a hotel is a good use for the site, the current zoning already allows hotel use. The proposed rezoning simply allows a larger hotel use, doubling the amount of development permitted on the site.

The existing development in this area on the south side of Duke Street is more moderate in density, providing the transition to lower density commercial and residential uses to the east called for in the master plan. Roundhouse Square and Duke Street Metro Center to the east have F.A.R.s of 0.48 and 0.65, and Duke Street Square, to the west of the subject property, was built to an FAR of 1.27. The recently developed Old Town Village residential project, immediately to the southeast of this project, was built at an overall FAR of 1.16. As proposed, the hotel project on this site is a 2.83 FAR, more than double the density of the adjoining projects along Duke Street.

Even the limits of the OCH zone are being pushed by the project; only by incorporating two strips of city owned property adjacent to the site into the site is the project able to have the land area necessary to bring the FAR below the maximum of 3.0. Without the city properties, the FAR would be 3.21. Only the Shurgard property, which is across Hooff's Run from the subject property, along Jamieson Avenue, approaches the FAR of the proposed hotel; the Shurgard property was rezoned to CDD#1 from OCM in 1997 by City Council based on an argument by the applicant that the site, because it is across the street from Carlyle development (and across from the Carlyle African American Heritage Park), should be permitted to have Carlyle densities.

While it is true that the higher density OCH (3.0 FAR) and CD (2.5 FAR) zones are located immediately across Duke Street to the north, staff believes that Duke Street forms the appropriate break-point for the higher density zoning because it forms a substantial physical barrier. Although further east Carlyle has higher densities along the south side of Duke Street, these densities were permitted only with a condition that a tunnel be built under Duke Street to increase Metrorail accessibility at a certain point in the development, and, even so, have a lower maximum density (2.62) than that proposed for this site (3.0).

In summary, staff does not support the proposed change in land use and zoning designation for the site because:

- 1) it is inconsistent with the theory of the approved King Street/Eisenhower Avenue plan, which concentrates densities at the Metrorail stations and which calls for more moderate densities along the south side of Duke Street in order to transition to lower density development to the east and south;
- 2) it allows for development much denser than the existing office and residential development immediately adjacent to the east and west along Duke Street and to the residential communities to the southeast.
- 3) it sets an undesirable precedent that property owners at the edge of high density zoned areas will seek to upzone their properties for higher density projects.

Staff recommends denial.

STAFF: Sheldon Lynn, Director, Department of Planning and Zoning;
Kimberley Johnson, Chief, Development;

RESOLUTION NO. MPA-99-0005

WHEREAS, under the Provisions of Section 9.05 of the City Charter, the Planning Commission may adopt amendments to the Master Plan of the City of Alexandria and submit to the City Council such revisions in said plans as changing conditions may make necessary; and

WHEREAS, an application for amendment to the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan section of the 1992 Master Plan was filed with the Department of Planning and Zoning on March 17, 1999 for changes in the land use designations to the parcels at 1460 Duke Street; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Planning and Zoning has analyzed the proposed revision and presented its recommendations to the Planning Commission; and

WHEREAS, a duly advertised public hearing on the proposed amendment was held on October 5, 1999 with all public testimony and written comment considered; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission finds that:

1. The proposed amendment is necessary and desirable to guide and accomplish the coordinated, adjusted and harmonious development of the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan section of the City; and

2. The proposed amendment is generally consistent with the overall goals and objectives of the 1992 Master Plan and with the specific goals and objectives set forth in the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan section of the 1992 Master Plan; and

3. The proposed amendment shows the Planning Commission's long-range recommendations for the general development of the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan; and

4. Based on the foregoing findings and all other facts and circumstances of which the Planning Commission may properly take notice in making and adopting a master plan for the City of Alexandria, adoption of the amendment to the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan section of the 1992 Master Plan will, in accordance with present and probable future needs and resources, best promote the health, safety, morals, order, convenience, prosperity and general

welfare of the residents of the City;

RESOLUTION NO. MPA-99-0005
Page 2

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Planning Commission of the City of Alexandria that:

1. The following amendment is hereby adopted in its entirety as an amendment to the King Street/Eisenhower Avenue Small Area Plan section of the 1992 Master Plan of the City of Alexandria, Virginia in accordance with Section 9.05 of the Charter of the City of Alexandria, Virginia:

Change the designation of parcels at 1460 Duke Street from OCM-100/Office Commercial Medium to CDD-1/Coordinated Development District.

2. This resolution shall be signed by the Chairman of the Planning Commission and attested by its secretary, and a true copy of this resolution forwarded and certified to the City Council.

ADOPTED the 5TH day of October, 1999.

W. B. Hurd, Chairman

ATTEST: _____
Sheldon Lynn, Secretary